week ending 6 OCTOBER 2006

Taleyarkhan *et al.* **Reply:** The Comment [1] has overlooked important aspects which result in incorrect conclusions.

Rather than argue about the merits or demerits of attempts at a computer code calculation for a "presumed experimental configuration and instrument settings-cumperformance," we directly obtained [2] additional experimental data with our laboratory's Cf-252 source with the same liquid scintillation and NaI detectors and settings used before [3,4]. We then show by direct one-on-one comparison in Fig. 1 that the reported spectra in our Letter [3,4] for neutron and γ photons are significantly different from corresponding spectra derived from a Cf-252 source. At the external detector face, D-D fusion (2.45 MeV) neutrons from our tests will not be monoenergetic due to down scattering with intervening atoms; hence, similar to neutrons from Cf-252, neutrons of various energies will reach the detector, the spectral shape of which is governed by complex 3D interactions with intervening media, detector train settings, age, etc. Cf-252 emits neutrons with an average energy of ~ 2 MeV [5], and super-



FIG. 1 (color online). (a) Measured neutron spectra for cavitation on [4] with hump ~ 2.5 MeV and for Cf-252 source (normalized at channel 10 to cavitation on spectrum). (b) Measured γ spectra for cavitation on [4] and for Cf-252 source (normalized at channel 5 to cavitation on spectrum).

ficial similarity with ~ 2.5 MeV down scattered neutrons should be expected, but this is *not* true for γ emissions. Importantly, our bubble fusion neutron spectrum [4] shown in Fig. 1(a) does display a (smeared) hump around the ~ 2.5 MeV proton-recoil-edge (PRE) [6] due to emitted neutrons being scattered downwards with atoms of test liquid and intervening ice packs and other paraffin shielding, along with γ photon leakage arising from the pulseshape discrimination (PSD) settings [2,3] which permit \sim 7% of high energy photons to leak into the neutron window. Some (small) counts above the ~ 2.5 MeV PRE should be expected from γ leakage and U fissions. The Cf-252 neutron spectrum is distinctly separate, monotonic, and shows no hump. The γ spectrum for Cf-252 is even more radically different [Fig. 1(b)] with no resemblance (neither in structure nor intensity) with published spectra [3,4].

Finally, the Comment [1] ignores the fact that a control experiment series has indeed been conducted using liquids with "H" bearing atoms with null results. Only deuterated benzene mixtures result in neutron emissions of ~ 17 to 30 standard deviations in statistical significance.

Our spectra [3,4] for neutron and γ emissions mixture could not have resulted from a Cf-252 source and are indeed consistent with that from a 2.45 MeV neutron source from within the test cell filled with C₃D₆-C₂Cl₄-C₃D₆O-UN.

The authors thank Professor Y. Danon of Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute and J. Lapinskas of Purdue University for their assistance.

R. P. Taleyarkhan,¹ R. C. Block,² R. T. Lahey, Jr.,²

R. I. Nigmatulin,³ and Y. Xu¹

- ¹Purdue University
- West Lafayette, Indiana 47907, USA
- ²Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute
- Troy, New York 12180, USA
- ³Russian Academy of Sciences
- 6 Karl Marx Street, Ufa 450000, Russia

Received 23 August 2006; published 3 October 2006 DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevLett.97.149404 PACS numbers: 78.60.Mg, 25.45.-z, 28.20.-v, 28.52.-s

- [1] B. Naranjo, preceding Comment, Phys. Rev. Lett. **97**, 149403 (2006).
- [2] See EPAPS Document No. E-PRLTAO-97-080640 for additional data. For more information on EPAPS, see http://www.aip.org/pubservs/epaps.html.
- [3] R.P. Taleyarkhan, C.D. West, R.T. Lahey, Jr., R.I. Nigmatulin, R.C. Block, and Y. Xu, Phys. Rev. Lett. 96, 034301 (2006).
- [4] See Ref. [3]'s EPAPS Document No. E-PRLTAO-96-019605 for supplemental information.
- [5] G.F. Knoll, *Radiation Detection and Measurement* (John Wiley and Sons, New York, 1999), 3rd ed.
- [6] N.P. Hawkes *et al.*, Nucl. Instrum. Methods Phys. Res., Sect. A 476, 190 (2002).