



400 Central Drive W. Lafayette, IN 47907-2017

Dr. Peter E. Dunn, Ph.D.
Professor
Associate Vice President for Research
Director, University Research Administration
Purdue University
Hovde Hall
610 Purdue Mall
West Lafayette, IN 47907-2040

March 5, 2008

Dear Dr. Dunn,

The February 9, 2006 email to Ms. Reich was sent couple weeks before the report of the fact-finding committee of the School of Nuclear Engineering emerged [C. K. Choi, F. M. Clikeman, K. O. Ott, Fact Finding Committee Report, School of Nuclear Engineering, Purdue University, February 23, 2006]. This report established three facts that were significant beyond any previous concerns:

- 1) Dr. Xu wrote the first draft of the NED paper [Y. Xu, A. Butt, "Confirmatory experiments for nuclear emissions during acoustic cavitation," Nuclear Engineering and Design, 235, pp. 1317-1324, 2005]. However, when Dr. Xu was asked who actually re-wrote it, Dr. Xu refused to disclose the name because "it could jeopardize the confirmatory nature of the experiments" in his own words.
- 2) Mr. Adam Butt was not involved in the experiment at all, he only did very minor clerical work related to the publication and was included in the last day as an author.
- 3) The PRL paper of Taleyarkhan et al (January 27, 2006) considered the NED paper of Xu and Butt an independent confirmation of Taleyarkhan's bubble fusion claims.

If Purdue wants the Committee not to be misled, it is important that the Committee be aware that I had not seen the report of the fact-finding committee nor read Taleyarkhan's PRL paper when I wrote the email to Ms. Reich. These significant developments severely altered my assessment of

the situation shortly after I sent that email.

I am displeased that Purdue took the extraordinary step of reviewing my e-mails and putting its thumb on the Committee scales by introducing a fragment (or, perhaps, that it permitted someone to introduce my e-mail into evidence who lacked even the fig leaf of an Administrative Policy to clothe his interception of e-mail). But if the chronology is clarified the Committee at least should not continue to be misled.

Sincerely,

Lift Tout

Lefteri H. Tsoukalas, PhD

Professor of Nuclear Engineering